



SMALL-SCALE BEHAVIOR CHANGE COMMUNICATION INTERVENTIONS 2016

SUMMARY REPORT



Background

Despite proven impact in other sectors, behavior change communication (BCC) is relatively underdeveloped in the cookstove sector. While there has been substantial investment in overcoming supply-side barriers to adoption of cleaner and more efficient cookstoves and fuels, there have been almost no sustained investments in BCC to help address demand-side barriers. Increased product adoption and use requires more than ensuring an available supply of user-friendly, high-performing stoves and fuels; it requires that consumers understand the value and benefits of the cleaner products and are motivated to access and pay for them. Evidence-based BCC can stimulate consumer purchasing behavior and build the “category” of cleaner stoves and fuels by providing information about the products’ features and benefits versus traditional cooking methods, where and how to buy products, and how to use them. BCC is also needed after purchase, to ensure correct and consistent use of cleaner and more efficient stoves and fuels.

In 2015 the Alliance launched a new project to design, implement, and assess a range of consumer-facing BCC campaigns in Alliance focus countries. These campaigns built on consumer research commissioned by the Alliance in 2014 and 2015 to better understand user needs and motivations and were intended to help the sector better understand how to drive increased demand and use of clean cooking products.

As a first step in reaching women and families with information about clean cooking and gathering evidence about what BCC approaches work best within the clean cookstove and fuel sector, the Alliance supported “small-scale” interventions in four of our focus countries - Guatemala, Uganda, Ghana, and Bangladesh. These campaigns ran for 2-5 months in 2016. They were intended to respond to a request from focus country stakeholders for greater Alliance support in demand creation while also generating learning that could be applied to later, larger-scale campaigns. By testing and evaluating BCC messages, channels, approaches, and use of innovations including mobile phone technology, the interventions were designed to expand the evidence base for effective BCC in the cookstove sector.

The interventions also sought to provide lessons on *how* cookstove stakeholders can most effectively collaborate on the ground to achieve desired results. Successful collaboration across the variety of players and key stakeholders— including government, private sector producers and distributors, and civil society – has been a key ingredient of category building campaigns in other sectors, and is particularly needed in the complex cookstove sector.

Summary of Approaches

Several different communication channels and approaches were used across the four countries - Guatemala, Uganda, Ghana, and Bangladesh - to convey messages about clean cooking ¹ The small-scale interventions were intentionally brand “agnostic” and were instead focused on the promotion of the overall clean cookstove and fuel category. They were designed to align with supply-side interventions and move individuals along a path from awareness of clean cooking to interest in purchasing to purchase and consistent use.

The creative approaches and channels used were determined based on research conducted with the target audiences to determine which aspects of cleaner and more efficient stoves and fuels are most compelling and would stimulate interest. Working with marketing and communication agencies in each country, key messages and creative collateral were developed and tailored for each target population. Research was also used to inform complementary channels most likely to reach and influence the target audience, including above-the-line (e.g. radio, TV) and below-the-line (e.g. IPC, and community events, such as market events and street theater) activities. The Alliance also worked in close collaboration with key partners in each country – including government, stove and fuel suppliers, and NGOs – to design and execute the interventions.

In **Guatemala**, the primary communication channel used was a radio soap opera called “Los Humos de Mi Barrio” or “My Neighborhood’s Smoke”. The radio soap opera was selected not only because of its potential for wide reach and its ability to convey several messages throughout the episodes, but also because it was an innovative channel that would stand out from other NGO led programs in Guatemala.

The radio soap opera consists of eight 5-minute episodes, and was aired on four different radio stations over eight weeks. It is narrated by a “market lady” and follows the lives of people in her community as they deal with the negative effects of cooking over open fires and learn about the advantages of using an improved cookstove.

Listeners of the soap opera were encouraged to seek out additional information on the campaign’s social media accounts and were also provided with a hotline number to call for information on where to purchase stoves. Information about the benefits of clean cookstoves and fuels was also disseminated through flyers and posters displayed throughout the targeted region. At the end of the campaign, soap opera listeners were invited to attend live finales. During these events, local stove manufacturers were on hand to demonstrate and sell their stoves.

In **Uganda**, the campaign was branded “Fumbalive,” a combination of the Lugandan word for cooking, “okufumba,” and the English word “live.” By reminding the audience of the involvement of “life” in cooking, the campaign title conveyed that you should not compromise your health or well-being while cooking. Creating a new branded term that was locally relevant captured the audience’s attention and generated excitement and buzz that got them talking about the campaign.

¹ Details of each intervention and all creative materials used are available at <http://cleancookstoves.org/market-development/demand-creation/behavior-change-communication.html>

The campaign’s tagline, “Cooking just got better,” tapped into the emotional insights revealed in the consumer research, showing that the target audience wanted the best for their families and aspired to a better way of life. Printed materials touched on the more functional benefits valued by the target audience, including reduced smoke and savings in fuel and money.

The Fumbalive message was disseminated in seven languages through various communication channels, including radio, video, social media, outdoor media (branded wall signs), road shows and market events, and door-to-door outreach in select communities. Radio, as the primary means of mass media communication in Uganda, was selected to reach a wide audience and



employed the use of short, dramatic spots broadcasted on 13 different radio stations. Short video dramas were aired before film screenings in community video halls – another popular form of communication in urban and peri-urban Uganda - and played on long distance coach buses.

The campaign also held live events in the form of “road shows” which employed a team of entertainers traveling on a Fumbalive branded truck. The road shows were paired with market events, during which manufacturers demonstrated and sold stoves while entertainers attracted crowds with dance competitions, raffles for free improved cookstoves, and distribution of branded products like t-shirts and aprons. In an attempt to reach a larger population with one-on-one communication, trained community health workers went door-to-door in each target region, giving information on cookstoves and directing people to the road show events. They brought along an improved cookstove to demonstrate and provided each home with print materials with additional information.

In **Ghana**, formative research showed that urban women in Ghana are quite busy, and struggle to work and care for their families, but they don’t want to compromise when it comes to making good food. They also want the most up-to-date, modern appliances and a clean kitchen to symbolize their success. Based on these insights, we developed a campaign around the concept of “Obaatan Boafo,” which means “Mother’s Helper” in the local Akan language. This tapped into the idea that with the right help (a new stove), a mother could make her cooking tasks less burdensome, provide a less smoky environment for herself and her family, and be seen as a successful woman.

Implemented in two districts in Ghana – Accra and Kumasi – Obaatan Boafo promoted the uptake of improved cookstoves through market demonstration events, interpersonal communication, radio ads and jingles. The radio ads, aired on 10 different stations in three local languages (Twi, Ga, and Hausa), included testimonials by key community leaders and early adopters of improved

cookstoves. The spots discussed the benefits of using improved charcoal stoves, clarified potential consumers' concerns, and drove the audience to points of sale.

In addition, a network of women's group leaders was engaged to motivate family and friends to purchase and use cleaner and more efficient cookstoves and to drive potential consumers to the market events. They primarily engaged women through small group meetings and door-to-door outreach. Market events were conducted on peak market days and included dramatic skits and demonstrations by stove suppliers. Women's group members were present at the markets to provide additional information about improved stoves and grow their advocacy network.

In **Bangladesh**, communication activities were implemented in twelve upazilas (subdistricts) in the Dhaka and Khulna regions, focused on promoting portable metal stoves that use wood and pellets. Research indicated that the target audience are heavily influenced by their peers, aspire to move up the social ladder, and take pride in providing for their families. In response to this aspiration to appear "modern," cookstoves were marketed as "modern stoves," with the tagline, "Times have changed, change your stove."

Communication channels included street theater, household visits, stove fairs, mobile cinema, print materials and outdoor media (billboards, teashop and rickshaw signs), and mobile advertising (SMS and social media). These channels were chosen after an examination of target audience profiles, which looked at the most effective ways to reach the consumers given their media use.



The Modern Stoves campaign placed particular emphasis on men as a target audience because of their role in influencing household expenditures. Men were a primary focus of the short film which centered around two brothers from a family that is struggling with financial and health issues due to their use of biomass fuels for cooking. The campaign also got a boost when the government, in coordination with the campaign, sent an SMS explaining the benefits of modern stoves and directing people to the campaign's Facebook page and hotline number.

Summary of Results

Evidence from the monitoring work conducted during the small-scale interventions revealed that the interventions were successful in reaching over 11 million people, **including 6.3 million women**, with messaging on clean cooking. This amounted to a cost per person reached of about \$.07. Recall of messages and changes in intent to purchase were also measured and showed positive results. Monitoring data was collected via before and after surveys at events, mobile surveys, and household surveys.

Recall and Changes in Intent

The campaign in **Guatemala** was found to have a statistically significant impact on intention to purchase and increased knowledge of perceived benefits of improved cookstoves. These findings suggest that the campaign effectively encouraged the target population to contemplate purchase and actually purchase cleaner and more efficient stoves. An event impact survey conducted at campaign events showed that attendees expressed a significantly higher level of intention to purchase an improved cookstove *after* learning about cookstoves at the event (67%) compared to those with the intention to purchase *before* the event (42%) ($p < .05$). The event survey also indicated that the messaging shared had an impact on people's knowledge about the benefits of improved stoves; for example, the post-event group was statistically significantly more likely to say that improved cookstoves use less fuel (45% compared to 34% in pre-event group) ($p < .10$).

In **Uganda**, to assess the impact of campaign activities on message recall, communication channel recall, and behavioral determinants, a mobile survey and pre- and post- event surveys were conducted among the target population and event attendees. The analyses of these surveys showed that the campaign positively influenced the target audience's purchasing behaviors, intention to purchase, and knowledge of the benefits of improved cookstoves.



An analysis of the audience before and after six market events suggests that the campaign events effectively communicated the advantages of improved cookstoves. When asked whether improved cookstoves produce less smoke, 74% of respondents in the post-event survey responded "yes," as opposed to only 33% during the pre-event survey ($p < .05$). The target audiences also expressed a

statistically significant higher level of intention to purchase an improved cookstove after the event (80%) compared to before the event (24%) ($p < .05$).

The mobile survey, completed by 314 members of the target population, showed a similar positive result among individuals visited by outreach workers: of the respondents who do not own an improved cookstove but had heard of the term, 68% labeled themselves as “very likely” to purchase one in the next three months. This mobile survey also found that respondents who could recall the campaign’s tagline of “Fumbalive” were very likely (86%) to have heard of improved cookstoves, compared to only 45% of those who hadn’t heard of Fumbalive. Lastly, the same survey found that 34% of respondents had purchased an improved cookstove, with 56% of them having purchased it in the last 3 months, indicating the likely awareness-raising and purchase motivating impact of the Fumbalive campaign.

Evaluation methods used in **Ghana** included a household (baseline and endline) survey, event impact survey, and rapid survey on radio programming. The findings indicate that the campaign reached a significant portion of the target population through radio, and that the campaign audience was able to correctly distinguish unimproved versus improved stoves, and identify benefits of improved cookstoves.

Event impact surveys conducted at eleven market events suggest that the messaging had a significant impact on people’s perceptions of improved stoves. In post-event surveys, 62% of respondents indicated that improved cookstoves save money, as opposed to only 24% in pre-event surveys ($p < .05$).

Respondents also identified “produces less smoke” as a benefit of improved stoves at a statistically significant higher rate in post-event surveys - 48% compared to 34% in pre-event surveys ($p < .05$). A rapid survey (with a sample size of 240) conducted by the marketing agency that produced the radio ads found that 60% of respondents were able to recall the radio messaging and cite at least one of the benefits of improved stoves. The key call to action, which was to go to your local market to purchase an improved cookstove, was cited by 62% of those who recalled the message.

Baseline and endline household surveys were conducted among the target population (baseline sample size = 600, endline = 638). The endline survey, conducted four months after the campaign concluded, showed that 84.7% recalled hearing about improved cookstoves on the radio. After the campaign had finished, 92.3% of survey respondents were able to correctly identify an unimproved stove, and 98.4% were able to identify improved cookstoves. The most commonly cited benefits (unprompted) of improved cookstoves were (1) reduced smoke (63.1%), (2) saves time (58.6%), (3) and saves money (49.2%). Lastly, the name of the campaign in Ghana was “Obaatan Boafo,” which means “Mother’s Helper” in the local Akan language and 22.8% of respondents identified an improved cookstove as a mother’s helper in the kitchen, an important indicator of message recall from the campaign.

In **Bangladesh**, event impact surveys were conducted at three types of events: mobile cinema, street theatre, and stove fairs. For all three events, respondents were statistically significantly more likely to accurately identify the advantages of using a modern stove (saves money, produces

less smoke, uses less fuel, is safer, is healthier, and can cook quickly) *after* the event compared to *before*. For example, 6% of stove fair attendees believed that modern stoves produced less smoke *before* the event, but this number increased to 97% *after* the event ($p < .05$). In addition, 13% of attendees *before* the mobile cinema events believed the modern stoves require less fuel; this figure rose to 83% *after* the event ($p < .05$).

When comparing the change from pre- to post- event among these three different events, the Alliance was able to observe which events created the most dramatic change in the audience's perceptions of modern stove benefits, and which advantages they understood most successfully. We found that, overall, stove fairs had the greatest impact in changing consumer perceptions. The fairs' audience members had a greater increase in their



ability to identify the advantages of saving money, producing less smoke, and cooking food quickly, than the audience members at the other events. Additionally, compared to the street theatre events, the fairs better communicated the idea that modern stoves use less fuel and are healthier, and compared to the messaging at the mobile cinemas, that these stoves create less smoke. The mobile cinemas were the most effective at communicating that the modern stoves are safe. These results show us that, generally, all three event types were successful in communicating the benefits of modern stoves, but different events had various strengths in their messaging.

In Bangladesh the Alliance also implemented a short SMS survey among the campaign's target population, six weeks after the activities were completed. This survey assessed message recall, communication channel exposure, and modern stove ownership and purchase information. The survey had a 21.4% response rate (99 of the 462 people contacted completed the survey).

79% of survey respondents had heard of Modern Chula, indicating a strong recall rate. Most respondents learned about Modern Chula through street theatre events (80%) and household visits (75%). The survey asked respondents to select the most important benefit of a Modern Chula – better for the environment, better for health, saves money, or prevents diarrhea (a “trap” answer intended to control for response bias - no respondents selected this option). For respondents who own a Modern Chula, they were much more likely to select “better for health” as a benefit (50%) followed by “saves money” (37.5%), compared to those who don't own a Modern Chula (32.1% selected “better for health,” 15.1% “saves money”). This may indicate that Modern Chula owners have witnessed firsthand the health and savings benefits of improved stoves.

Of those surveyed that already own a Modern Chula, 62.5% purchased it in the past 5 months, potentially due to the Modern Chula campaign. Nearly half (45.6%) of those who do not currently own a Modern Chula indicated that they are “very likely” to purchase one in the next three months.

Sales Results

As intended in the design of the project, we did not attempt to track stove and fuel uptake over time as part of the small-scale interventions given the pilot nature of the interventions and corresponding budget and time allocation. Making direct sales attributions to the campaigns while they were active - beyond those stoves and fuels sold directly at events - was also difficult given the limited resources we had for monitoring, as well as limited bandwidths at the stove companies to closely track sources of referrals. Attributing sales to the relatively short campaigns is also challenging given the delay between changes in intention to purchase and actual purchase of expensive durable goods like cookstoves. That said, sales of cookstoves and fuels, as reported by stove companies who participated in the events and other activities, increased steadily during the campaigns and overall trends were positive.

In terms of sales conversions at events, suppliers reported 180 stoves were sold directly at the three live events in Guatemala. With an estimated total audience of 1500 people, this indicates that approximately 12% of event attendees purchased an improved cookstove – an impressive conversion rate. This could have been because audiences heard about cookstoves for 8 weeks on the radio before they were invited to attend the events, allowing them time to consider and discuss purchase within their families.

Small Scale BCC Interventions - Summary of Results						
Country	Estimated number of people reached*	Cost per person reached	Total attendance at campaign events	Total stoves sold directly at events	Sales conversion rate at events	YOY Total Sales Growth Rate
Guatemala	250,000	\$ 0.40	1,500	180	12%	229%
Uganda	5,500,000	\$ 0.04	16,000	2831	18%	1182%
Ghana	5,000,000	\$ 0.04	12,000	362	3%	16%
Bangladesh	400,000	\$ 0.56	49,500	1142	2%	135%
Total	11,150,000	\$ 0.07	79,000	4,515	6%	113%

*Approx. 15 million people were reached in Bangladesh via a government sponsored SMS message that relayed key messages from the campaign - this has not been included here since it was not directly funded under the campaign.

In Uganda, conversion at events was also impressive, with a total of 2,831 stoves sold at market events – this breaks down to 18% of the approximately 16,000 event attendees purchasing an improved cookstove. Again here, an extensive radio campaign and effective coordination with the door to door outreach workers who visited homes in the area before events and encouraged people to attend, likely helped to prime people for purchase.

A total of 942 stoves were sold at market events in Bangladesh– this means about 2% of the 49,500 people who attended an event made a purchase. Conversion at these events was likely low for a few reasons: the live theater events attracted a lot of children and casual bystanders; the campaign was not accompanied by any mass media intervention to tee up interest; and for many people, the concept of an improved stove has historically been associated with the long promoted “bondhu chula”, which is a slightly improved built-in stove, whereas the stoves being promoted at the events were portable metal stoves that are quite new to the Bangladesh market. Many people showed interest, but wanted more information on durability and warranties.

In Ghana, 362 stoves were sold at market events throughout the Obaatan Boafo campaign, resulting in 3% of 12,000 attendees purchasing a stove at events. This was lower than anticipated, and was partly because supply inventory was lower than expected at the time. This was largely driven by one company’s relatively abrupt decision to move more of its operations and sales outside Ghana. Given the short-term nature of the campaign, other suppliers were not able to respond rapidly enough to fill the gap.

Again, it should be emphasized that stoves are a household appliance and therefore a significant purchase for any family. The conversion rates at events during the campaigns are therefore quite impressive given how substantial of a cost these stoves represent relative to a household’s monthly income.

In terms of overall sales trends, our partners reported triple digit growth in each country, besides Ghana, from 2015 to 2016 – when the campaigns were implemented. Of course, many other factors could have contributed to this growth, but they are a positive indication of success of the campaigns.

Use of Mobile Technology

Another key outcome from the interventions was evidence of how mobile technology can be used as a cost-efficient means of spreading information on cooking and tracking campaign results. Use of mobile technology is increasingly becoming an integral component of public health and development initiatives, and is widely regarded as an effective BCC channel for promoting healthy behaviors, products, and services. Mobile phones provide efficiencies for these types of interventions in multiple ways, including: reaching individuals with information on specific products and services via SMS; conducting surveys and gathering feedback; and promoting community events and meetings. In many cases, mobile phone initiatives are linked with social support networks such as Facebook or Twitter, and can also be with combined with websites where individuals can access additional information, relevant apps, and support for products and services.

Despite its increasingly ubiquitous use in other sectors, the use of mobile technology in the cooking sector is still relatively limited. To gain insights into the feasibility and effectiveness of including mobile technology in clean cooking campaigns, in Uganda, Ghana, and Bangladesh we carried out relatively low-cost (roughly 5% of campaign costs) pilots with mobile platforms as a communications channel to reinforce key messages, monitor campaign reach and recall, track outreach efforts, and enable contact between communicators.

In Ghana, Uganda, and Bangladesh, we partnered with VOTO mobile (VOTO), a Ghana-based social enterprise that provides a propriety platform for mobile engagement. VOTO's platform was particularly appealing because it does not require the user to speak or write English, or to have a smartphone.

In Ghana, the campaign used VOTO's platform to support a women's advocacy network. The campaign created a network of 40 women's group leaders or "advocates" who, after receiving training, were tasked with talking to women they know about cleaner and more efficient cookstoves and directing potential consumers to cookstove retail outlets. These 40 advocates had the task of recruiting and registering 10 women "promoters" through the mobile platform, and each of those 400 promoters were asked to register another 10 women. The VOTO platform was used to track registration and network growth, and enabled communication between the advocates and promoters. The mobile platform was also used to implement a system to reward women with phone credits each time they registered another woman in the system. In addition, each registrant was automatically entered in a drawing for a free improved cookstove of their choice, and if they opted into additional messages they received follow up voice messages about the benefits of clean cooking.

Registration proved to be much lower than expected. Originally, only 6 of the 40 recruited advocates successfully completed their registration, and they registered an additional 30 women into the promoter network. This low registration was largely due to ongoing uncertainty about the registration process, including lack of experience with the Interactive Voice Response (IVR)² technology. Some women also indicated that they were too busy, or already received too many messages on their phone and did not see the value in signing up for the hotline. It is also likely that the phone credit and free cookstove were not enough incentive to register. After realizing the low registration rates, campaign coordinators contacted the other unregistered advocates directly, and assisted them in the registration process; this led to a total of 29 registered advocates. With help from coordinators in registering promoters, a total of 342 women were registered in the promoter network and hotline.

Of these 342 registrants, the call pickup rate for the reminder voice messages was 70-90% on average, with up to 40% of those who picked up then proceeding to listen to the entire message, which VOTO indicated is on par with similar campaigns they have conducted. This suggested that the registration process, instead of a lack of interest, may have indeed been the biggest barrier.

² Interactive voice response (IVR) is a technology that allows a computer to interact with humans through the use of voice and input via a keypad.

Despite the limited results, the mobile approach offered some key lessons learned for using mobile technology in cookstove BCC, including:

- Invest in training of outreach workers until they are fully comfortable with and competent in using the phone technology (e.g. IVR) and demonstrating to others how to use it;
- Ensure potential respondents – particularly women – actually own and have *regular* access to a mobile phone;
- Assess the landscape before choosing mobile technology and consider not using mobile if the target population considers mobile messaging a nuisance; and
- If incentives are included, allow time for iteration to refine the incentive scheme.

In Bangladesh, the Alliance leveraged its partnership with the Bangladeshi government’s Sustainable and Renewable Energy Development Authority (SREDA) to send out SMS messages with information on clean cooking. Along with briefly describing some key benefits of improved cookstoves, the SMS also included a link to the campaign’s Facebook page and the phone number for a helpline, where callers could inquire about features of improved stoves and where to purchase them. The SMS blasts were sent to the country’s Telecommunication Regulatory Authority’s subscribers, reaching approximately 15 million across Bangladesh. This was a government-led initiative that came at no additional cost to the campaign. There is great potential to continue this scheme in Bangladesh and other countries where government interest can be leveraged.

Mobile was also used to implement post-campaign surveys in Uganda and Bangladesh. These surveys were sent out at the end of the campaigns to phone numbers collected by outreach workers who conducted household visits. Survey participants completed the short, 10-15 question survey using IVR technology or keypads. The questions were all closed ended (multiple choice or yes/no), and assessed campaign recall, communication channel recall, and clean cookstove ownership and



purchase information, along with some basic demographic information. The Uganda survey had a sample size of 314 completed surveys (26% of the 1200 people contacted), and the Bangladesh survey had a sample size of 99 (21% of the 462 contacted). In both countries, the participants were incentivized to complete the survey by being entered into a lottery to win a free cookstove. The response rates and the quality of information collected via the mobile surveys were overall successful, and would be an effective means of collecting information in future campaigns.

Summary of Key Lessons Learned

The small-scale campaigns were effective in reaching a large number of people through a variety of complementary communication channels. People reached by the campaign had high recall of campaign messages and generally expressed higher intention to purchase an improved cookstove. Longer duration campaigns of this type, using similar evidence-based approaches, are likely to contribute substantially to increased purchase of cleaner and more efficient cookstoves and fuels. The campaigns also succeeded in engaging several stakeholders in the design, execution, and monitoring of activities, which will contribute to building a foundation for collaborative sector-wide initiatives.

Future campaigns should, however, keep in mind key lessons learned which suggest areas for improvement. Many of these lessons learned relate to the challenges of implementing a category-building campaign in a sector that is still early in its growth, characterized by a wide range of technologies offered by suppliers who vary greatly in their capacity to design and deliver products that meet customer needs at prices that are affordable to them.

Key Lessons:

Define the category. The small-scale campaigns were intended to promote an improved cookstoves “category” that is, in fact, comprised of many sub-categories – different types of cookstoves that combust different fuels and perform at varying levels in terms of improved efficiency and decreased emissions. In some markets, many of the available cookstoves do not deliver the same benefits compared to traditional cookstoves and three-stone fires. Therefore, it is critical for implementers and local stakeholders to decide which cookstoves will be promoted and receive communications support during the campaign. Given the (at times) differing agendas and priorities of stakeholders in the market, this can be a time-intensive process. Future campaigns should approach this challenge deliberately and build adequate time into workplans.

Anticipate and address concerns that manufacturers and stakeholders may have about the scope and scale of a category-building campaign. Defining the category in a way that requires meeting performance criteria may exclude some manufacturers, creating concerns that need to be addressed. In addition, governments and stakeholders may want to promote local industry while also finding a way to meet the population’s need for high-quality products, and these goals are not always easily reconciled. Government and civil society actors may also want to prioritize certain geographic areas that do not necessarily align with areas where manufacturers believe they can develop a sustainable customer base. Some manufacturers, for their part, would generally prefer to receive funding directly to market their own brands rather than participate in a category-wide campaign where their products may not be distinguished from others (and they may fear that their brand equity will be at risk through association with lower-performing products). These challenges extend to collaborative message development, as each producer/distributor would naturally prefer to have their technology, and what they consider its most important benefits, featured most prominently. The small-scale campaigns approached these challenges by emphasizing the importance of the findings from the market and consumer research, and that what interests/resonates with the target audience is a key component in facilitating behavior

change. Getting agreement on the rationale for the scope and scale of a category-building campaign, as well as message development, in which public money creates opportunities for a range of manufacturers is a critical step in campaign design and execution.

Communicate clearly to consumers regarding which products are being promoted. Ideally, category-building campaigns would refer consumers to a government-approved label that certifies product performance and guides consumers in their product choices. As most developing markets do not yet have cookstove labeling programs, category-building campaigns need to find other ways to communicate “qualified” products to consumers. In the absence of a labeling program, it was generally challenging to promote the category without being too generic (which creates confusion as to which stoves can be considered “improved” or “clean”). Many potential consumers did not know what an improved cookstove looked like before the campaigns. This challenge would seem easier in campaigns focused on a subset of stove types (e.g. in Ghana where the campaign focused on charcoal stoves), but even then, designs vary enough that coming up with a generic stove image that represents all options is a challenge. In Bangladesh, the campaign addressed this challenge by developing a campaign logo (windmill), which was used on distributed materials as well as points of sale so consumers could make the connection when they make a purchase.

Establish clear roles and responsibilities and reliable coordination mechanisms among stakeholders. In a campaign that is intended to benefit an entire sector or sub-sector of a market, sharing responsibilities for campaign execution, monitoring, and reporting can be an effective way to ensure broad stakeholder contribution and buy-in. The small-scale campaigns generally achieved a high level of collaboration, but not always from the start. Thought should be given to coordination mechanisms at the outset of the campaign design to ensure strong design and oversight throughout.

Ensure that supply-side interventions are adequate. When campaigns are successful in generating consumer demand, it is critical that supply responds or demand will go unmet. It was challenging to ensure adequate supply where needed during parts of the campaigns, although there were usually active supply-side interventions implemented concurrently with the campaigns. The supply barriers varied country to country – in some areas, there were limited retailers that sold stoves, and in others, manufacturing was not yet industrialized enough to be able to meet increasing demand. Although in many countries improved stoves are increasingly available in retail outlets like supermarkets, and in traditional markets, many partners continue to rely heavily on door-to-door sales and partnerships with NGOs and other non-traditional distribution channels. This made it challenging, particularly in the radio mentions, to direct the audience to outlets where multiple stove options could be purchased. The campaigns instead directed people to a hotline or Facebook page for further info, which created another step for consumers, and required additional manpower. Campaigns should define a clear supply-side engagement strategy from the start.

Ensure follow-ups with potential consumers. A common challenge faced across all countries was the limited time the market events and/or roadshows allowed for interaction with the target audience. A new appliance for the home is typically not an impulse buy, and generally requires a discussion with other members of the household and consideration of whether the cash needed is

available. Additionally, in many settings, while the woman may desire to purchase, the male household head usually controls the allocation of resources. In some instances, both individuals may not be present at the same time. Therefore, a key recommendation from implementing partners was to plan for multi-day market activations, where people could come back the next day if they are interested in making a purchase. In fact, one of the possible reasons there were higher sales numbers in Uganda was that cookstove sales teams visited households in target regions prior to the market activations, where they spoke to families about the benefits of stoves and suggested that they attend the market events. This gave women a chance to consider making the purchase and speak to their husbands about the investment before going to the market events.

Ensure adequate support for use mobile technology. Despite increasing use of mobile for various development initiatives, it is still a relatively new channel for many consumers. In Ghana, the campaign encountered several challenges with the mobile women’s advocacy network, which seemed to be largely due to lack of motivation to participate and confusion surrounding the platform. In the future, it will be important to ensure that potential respondents are comfortable using the phone technology (such as IVR) and that they consider the selected incentives motivational – otherwise, they may not participate. It is also good practice to scan the landscape before choosing a mobile technology and consider not using mobile if the target population considers mobile messaging a nuisance. As an evaluation tool, VOTO mobile’s platform proved to be quick and easy to implement. As it was simple to collect mobile numbers from household visits, little extra effort was involved once the survey was developed and translated, and a contract was finalized with the mobile platform. There are, however, limitations to mobile surveys – they need to be short) to keep the attention of the respondent; they have low response rates; they are only able to be completed by phone owners and users; and technical problems can arise through the mobile platform, the mobile phone, or the user themselves.

Conclusion

Overall, the small-scale interventions were successful and achieved their goals of reaching millions of women with information on clean cooking, and clearly showed that exposure to the campaigns had an impact on intention to purchase cleaner stoves and fuels. They also yielded valuable insights and best practices for campaign design and execution, as well as how to most effectively collaborate with stove and fuel companies, and other key stakeholders, including national and local governments. These insights and learnings were instrumental in the design of the large-scale Alliance supported interventions currently being undertaken in Bangladesh, Kenya, and Nigeria³. Key learnings have also been shared with partners at various events and meetings in hopes of inspiring better BCC outcomes across the clean cooking sector and beyond. Additional reports on lessons learned from the Alliance’s BCC program will be released in 2018-2019.

³ <http://cleancookstoves.org/about/news/07-26-2016-alliance-funds-programs-to-spur-demand-for-cleaner-cookstoves-and-fuels.html>