USAID/WASHplus Bangladesh: Assessing Consumer Needs, Preferences and Willingness to Pay for ICS

Elisa Derby
ETHOS 2014
What is WASHplus?

WASHplus is a five-year (2010-2015) cooperative agreement funded through USAID’s Bureau for Global Health, managed by FHI 360 with Winrock and CARE as core partners.

WASHplus supports healthy households and communities by creating and supporting interventions that lead to improvements in access, practice and health outcomes related to water supply, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) and household air pollution (HAP).

USAID/Bangladesh requested WASHplus assistance in exploring key consumer issues to contribute to CCEB, Global Alliance and other stakeholder efforts. Cross-cutting collaboration/funding (USAID Health and Energy, Asia Regional Bureau, Bangladesh mission, State/GPI, GACC ).
Challenges

If improved cookstoves have so many benefits, why is the problem so difficult to solve?

1. No “one size fits all” cookstove
2. Lab performance ≠ field performance
3. The “best” stoves can be unappealing to cooks
4. Stove “stacking” is the norm
5. Lack of IAP health risk awareness
6. Poverty
7. Higher priorities for $
8. Lack of HH purchase decision making power
Behavior Change

Improved cookstove adoption depends on:
1. Access
2. Affordability (including financing)
3. Decision making power for purchases
4. Awareness and prioritization

But getting a stove into someone’s home is only half the battle....

Sustained improved cookstove use depends on:
1. Correct operation and maintenance
2. Fuel availability and requirements
3. Cooking needs
4. Stoves ‘delivering’ benefits consumers want

WASHplus also focuses on other BC techniques to lower exposure of users AND implementers
Bangladesh Study Objectives

**Phase 1:** Consumer needs, preferences, and willingness to pay to increase the adoption and correct and consistent use of improved cookstoves in Bangladesh. (Dec 2012 – Sept 2013)

**Phase 2:** Marketing and behavior change strategy, evidence-based approaches to increase the uptake of stoves, practical “how-to” tools. Tools and resources for other Asia regional cookstove programs and implementers. (Sept 2013 – April 2014)

Strong focus on evidence-based programming and gender.

Builds on USAID-funded Winrock market assessment and other regional inputs. Results will feed into Bangladesh Mission’s CCEB program, Global Alliance activities, Bangladesh Country Action Plan, World Bank/IDCOL activities.
Current options:

Left: Traditional sunken-hole stove (2 pot version)

Right: Bondhu chula; the current model of improved stove most widely disseminated in Bangladesh. Built-in place chimney stove.
Consumer preference trials
*in-home testing over time*

**Phase 1: Household consumer preference trials:**

- 5 stove types * 3 homes ea. * 2 divisions
  - * 4 villages ea. = 120 hh
  - Barisal (south) villages: Billobari, Bihangal, Ichakathi, and Gonpara
  - Sylhet (NW) villages: Jangail, Kewa, Tilargaon, and Kunarchor

- Representative of market – wood as primary fuel
- Semi-structured questionnaires- qualitative and quantitative
  - ✓ Installation and baseline
  - ✓ 3 day initial assessment/problem solving visit
  - ✓ 21 day final survey
- Willingness to pay assessment, 2 methods
- Kitchen Performance Tests
- SUMS monitoring
- IAP monitoring
5 stoves tested - focus on type, not brand
**Consumer Preference, WTP**

**Envirotex Z3000**  
- Single-pot built-in-place rocket-design stove

**EcoZoom Dura**  
- Single-pot portable rocket-design stove

**Prakti LeoChimney**  
- Two-pot metal chimney stove

**Greenway Smart Stove**  
- Single-pot portable natural draft gasifier stove

**Alpha Renewable Energy Eco Chula**  
- Single-pot portable fan (forced air) gasifier stove  
  (battery/solar powered)
Our Study Sample

• Barisal (south) villages: Billobari, Bihangal, Ichakathi, and Gonpara

• Sylhet (NW) villages: Jangail, Kewa, Tilargaon, and Kunarchor

• Most families 4-5 people; average size of 5.3

• Primary wood fuel usage

• Poor, but not the very bottom of the pyramid

• All participants were 16–65 years old; about 60% of participants were cooks below 35 years old
Key Findings

• Households felt ALL STOVES WERE GOOD STOVES and recognized many benefits
• NONE of the 5 stoves (as currently produced) meet all -- or even most -- consumer needs
• NONE would completely replace traditional stoves
• Cook satisfaction with the improved stoves DECREASED over the 3 week trial when compared to their responses after 3 days of use
Overall Non-relative Opinions

Improved Cookstove is Good

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Environfit</th>
<th>Prakti</th>
<th>Greenway</th>
<th>EcoZoom</th>
<th>Eco-Chula</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>n = 101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What did people like about the stoves?

Less firewood/fuel
Emits less smoke
Well manufactured
Less soot/cleaner
Looks nice
Portable/good handle
Cooks food quickly
Decreasing satisfaction over time

Number Preferring ICS over Traditional Stove, at 3 Day and 3 Week

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stove</th>
<th>3 Day</th>
<th>3 Week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Envirofit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenway</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EcoZoom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EcoChula</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prakti</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of responses

n = 101

# of stoves
Envirofit = 20
Greenway = 21
EcoZoom = 19
Eco-Chula = 20
Prakti = 21
Preferences by District

Number of Cooks Preferring ICS to Traditional Stove, by District at 3 Weeks

- Prakti
- Grameen Greenway
- Envirofit
- Eco-Chula
- EcoZoom

Barisal
Sylhet

n = 118
Problems identified by cooks

### Cooking Problems

- Difficult to add small pieces from top
- Not stable while stirring
- Ash builds up quickly
- Longer to cook larger amounts
- Can't cook rice in large quantities
- Pots become black/difficult to clean
- Fuel chamber small
- Can't use large pieces of wood
- Don't like/difficult to chop wood into small pieces
- Difficult to ignite (smoky)
- Charred wood/embers fall out of tray
- Wood falls out of opening
- Flame doesn't spread

**Number of responses**

- Greenway: 24
- Eco-Chula: 24
- EcoZoom: 23
- Envirofit: 24
- Prakti: 23

**n = 118**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problems</th>
<th>Solutions suggested by Users</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not stable while stirring</td>
<td>Make the stove stable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ash builds up quickly</td>
<td>Add ash tray</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cannot cook in second pot due to lack of heat</td>
<td>Increase heat in the second pot by placing fuel chamber between first and second pot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cannot cook large quantities of food like rice and takes longer to cook larger quantities</td>
<td>Larger sizes of stoves should be available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel chamber small so wood falls off the opening and charred wood and embers fall out</td>
<td>Fuel chamber should be larger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cannot use large wood pieces/cannot chop wood pieces, cannot effortlessly feed wood.</td>
<td>Address problems related to wood size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flame does not spread</td>
<td>Flame should reach vessel and be visible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to ignite, and add small wood pieces, Pots become black and difficult to clean.</td>
<td>These ‘changes’ or ‘solutions’ revealing, but not something recommended for modifications/ implementation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Who would buy?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What Kind of People Would Use This (These) New Stoves?</th>
<th>Frequency n = 120</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small families</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern people</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thrifty people</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simple, ordinary family</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Someone people respect</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People/families living in cities</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small families who buy fuel</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smart people</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People living in rented apartment</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich families</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
KPTs and SUMS

**KPTs funded through S-GPI Grant**

Cross-sectional, 116 study households, 24 control HHs
IAP monitoring in a subset of 7 households: PM$_{2.5}$ and CO

KPT findings
- Households using all but one model of improved stove (alongside their traditional stove) used 16-30% less fuel
- Households using one model used 17% more fuel – installation and consumer education problem?
- All stoves reduced IAP

SUMS findings
- All homes used improved stoves, but none did so exclusively
- All homes used ALL stove less once we stopped coming to do daily measurements!
Willingness to Pay

**Auction:** 105 study participants given the option to purchase the stoves at market value ($19-54). Only one opted to do so, and a second nonparticipant neighbor purchased a stove.

**Buy back:** 15 households were offered the stoves as gifts, then given an option of a cash buyout at market value ($19-54). Only three opted for the (relatively significant) cash; **the other 12 preferred to keep their stove!**

When ‘acquisition barriers were removed, householders valued the stoves.
Next Steps

WASHplus Bangladesh Phase 2 runs through April:

– *Stove design improvements for the Bangladesh market, CCTs and further consumer preference testing!*

– Develop a generic marketing and behavior change strategy

– Identify key segments most ready to purchase ICS

– Apply a “4Ps” analysis (product, place, price and promotion) to the Bangladesh cookstove market: product, place, price and promotion for each segment

– Concept test key elements of these approaches; and

– Develop practical “how-to” tools to contribute to the goals and results of USAID energy and health objectives in Bangladesh
WASHplus contacts

Elisa Derby, WASHplus HHE Specialist
Winrock International
617-524-0466
ederby@winrock.org

Julia Rosenbaum, WASHplus Deputy Director
and Senior Behavior Change Specialist
FHI 360
202-884-8838
jrosenbaum@fhi360.org

http://www.washplus.org